



PROJECT NARRATIVE AND FINANCIAL PROGRESS REPORT

SUPPORT TO THE IMPROVEMENT OF LEGAL AID PRACTICES FOR ACCESS TO JUSTICE FOR ALL IN TURKEY

JULY 2018 – MAY 2019

Outline

1. Project Synopsis

2. Purpose

3. Results

- General assessment of results (lessons learned, follow-up actions and unforeseen results)**
- i) **Narrative reporting on results**
- ii) **Indicator Based Performance Assessment**
- iii) **Success story**

4. Resources

5. Annexes

1. PROJECT SYNOPSIS

Project Name	Support to the Improvement of Legal Aid Practices for Access to Justice for All in Turkey
Location	Turkey
Project Duration	44 months
Project Start Date	1 September 2015
Project End Date	31 May 2019 (including the no-cost extension period between January and May 2019)
Reporting Period	July 2018 – May 2019
Overall Objective	The Project aimed to develop coordinated efforts for enhancing the quality of the legal aid services in Turkey as well as capacity of the attorneys, particularly addressing the needs of disadvantaged groups as well as Syrian population at southern provinces of Turkey. In addition, the Project also addresses the institutional needs of Bar Associations for an effective coordinated and monitored legal aid system.
Direct Beneficiary	Union of Turkish Bar Associations
Target Groups	The target group of the Project are vulnerable individuals, especially people subjected to violence. The target group included women, children, youth, people with disabilities and refugees residing in south-east region of Turkey.
Final Beneficiaries	Union of Turkish Bar Associations, Ministry of Justice, lawyers practicing legal aid, non-governmental organizations, people subjected to violence who need legal counselling and assistance and refugees.
Expected Results (Outcomes)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Improved Automation System for Appointment of Code of Criminal Procedure (CCP) Attorneys 2. Enhanced Capacity of the Attorneys Practicing Legal Aid for Disadvantaged Groups 3. Improved Performance Evaluation System for Legal Aid Services 4. Enhanced Coordination and Cooperation Among the Attorneys Practicing Legal Aid 5. Legal aid needs underpinned, and services improved in southern border province of Turkey such as Gaziantep, Hatay, Kilis, Şanlıurfa and Kahramanmaraş
Main Activities	<u>Outcome 1: Improved Automation System for Appointment of Code of Criminal Procedure (CCP) Attorneys</u>

- 1.1 - Conduct visits to 5 pilot local bar associations to assess the current situation and needs
- 1.2 - Conduct interviews with users of the Automation System
- 1.3 - Develop an assessment report including a set of recommendations for a better functioning Automation System
- 1.4 - Organize a technical workshop for the scale up of the automation system and possible internal regulation
- 1.5 - Develop and widely disseminate a user-friendly guideline for the use of the updated system

Outcome 2: Enhanced Capacity of the Attorneys Practicing Legal Aid for Disadvantaged Groups

- 2.1 - Conduct a comparative assessment on legal aid practices
- 2.2 - Conduct a study tour to a Continental Europe Country
- 2.3 - Conduct interviews with 5 selected bar associations and Union of Bar Associations
- 2.4 - Desk review of the data on cases subject to legal aid
- 2.5 - Develop a report on the assessment of the legal aid practices targeting women, children and youth
- 2.6 - Develop tailor-made training modules for the CCP attorneys
- 2.7 - Organize a meeting with the participation of the Heads of Trainee Education Commissions
- 2.8 - Develop selection criteria for the attorneys who will attend the trainings
- 2.9 - Deliver 10 one-day tailor-made training programs for CCP attorneys (300)
- 2.10 - Develop tailor-made Guidelines for the use of CCP attorneys on legal aid

Outcome 3: Improved Performance Evaluation System for Legal Aid Services

- 3.1 - Develop a comparative analysis report on the monitoring and evaluation of the quality of legal aid services
- 3.2 - 2. Organize 3 consultation meetings with Consultation Group in Ankara
- 3.3 - Develop the first draft performance criteria
- 3.4 - Organize 7 regional meetings with the representatives of Bar Associations to discuss the first draft
- 3.5 - Finalize the performance criteria of the attorneys performing legal aid and evaluation model.

Outcome 4: Enhanced Coordination and Cooperation Among the Attorneys Practicing Legal Aid

- 4.1 - Develop an interactive website where the attorneys practicing legal aid can follow the recent developments

	<p><u>Outcome 5: Legal aid needs underpinned, and services improved in southern border province of Turkey such as Gaziantep, Hatay, Kilis, Şanlıurfa and Kahramanmaraş</u></p> <p>5.1 - Conduct visits to 2 local bar associations and interviews with attorneys/mukhtars/NGOs, etc.</p> <p>5.2 - Develop a needs assessment/recommendations report focusing on locality-specific legal aid needs</p> <p>5.3 - Conduct technical trainings for 200 Attorneys in referred provinces</p> <p>5.4 - Organize 2 coordination meetings with civil society organizations by Advisory Committee</p> <p>5.5 - Develop a strategy paper and road map for UTBA for improvement of legal aid services</p>
--	--

2. PURPOSE

The Project aims to develop coordinated efforts for enhancing the quality of the legal aid services in Turkey as well as capacity of the attorneys, particularly addressing the needs of disadvantaged groups as well as Syrian population at southern provinces of Turkey. In addition, the Project will also address the institutional needs of Bar Associations for an effective coordinated and monitored legal aid system.

The Project will have the following results for enhancing the effectiveness and efficiency of the legal aid system in Turkey:

- Improved Automation System for Appointment of Code of Criminal Procedure (CCP) Attorneys
- Enhanced Capacity of the Attorneys Practicing Legal Aid for Disadvantaged Groups
- Improved Performance Evaluation System for Legal Aid Services
- Enhanced Coordination and Cooperation Among the Attorneys Practicing Legal Aid
- Legal aid needs underpinned, and services improved in southern border province of Turkey such as Gaziantep, Hatay, Kilis, Şanlıurfa and Kahramanmaraş

3. RESULTS

i) Narrative reporting on results:

Result I: Improved Automation System for Appointment of Code of Criminal Procedure (CCP) Attorneys

Activities and dates		Outputs and dates		Result
Technical meeting with representatives from 79 Bar Associations for the scale-up of the automation system and discussions around the internal	Ankara/İzmir: 12-13.05.2018	Submission of the recommendations report for better use of Automation System for cases related to Syrian population	Cannot achieved, cancelled.	Improved Automation System for Appointment of Code of Criminal Procedure (CCP) Attorneys

regulation		Submission of Internal Regulation for the Use of System by all Bar Associations	February 2019, partially achieved.	
------------	--	---	------------------------------------	--

Analysis Section

1. During the meeting in Bolu between the dates 02-04.02.2018 total of 32 people representing bar associations, Ministry of Justice, NGOs, UNDP participated, there were 30 participants in the meeting between 3-4 March 2018 and 132 participants on the event between 12-13 May 2018 including representative from 79 bar association.
2. Meeting on 12-13 May 2018 was a combined meeting for presenting the training modules developed under Component II and Component V. It is decided to organize a combined meeting to have better budget adjustment and time management as well as to have some savings which provided to spare budget for newly integrated activity on amendment to legal aid legislation proposal. The meeting on 12-13 May 2018 has been reflected to media by Habertürk
3. During the period of July 2018-May 2019, the New Automation Regulation was discussed among the project partners and it is decided that a regulation needs to be adjusted and it must be revised again. Revision of the automation system were for enabling unification, standardization among 79 bar associations and it aimed to initiate a more centralized automation system. However, it was not possible for UTBA to confirm and start the official process for the dissemination of the document as there was opposition by many local bar associations. The bar associations were not ready to adopt the new automation system to be initiated. During İzmir meeting under Outcome I, draft regulation system was presented by IC recruited by UNDP. During the presentation some resistance was received by the representatives of bar associations. The automation systems' update was not accepted by 79 bars during the İzmir meeting.

Result II – Enhanced Capacity of the Attorneys Practicing Legal Aid for Disadvantaged Groups

Activities and dates		Outputs and dates		Result
Meeting to present report and training module to Heads of Trainee Education Commissions of 79 Bar Associations	Ankara/Antalya: 12-13.05.2018	Tailor-made guidelines for CCP* attorneys on legal aid in line with European and United Nations standards. Training manual for the bar associations	Draft: 06.07.2018 Final: 20.07.2018	The tailor-made guidelines for CCP attorneys in line with

Consultation Group Meeting to finalize the proposals on necessary amendments to the relevant legislation	August 2018	Proposal on necessary amendments to relevant legislation for improved legal aid services for disadvantaged groups	Draft: 15.07.2018 Final: 31.08.2018	European and United Nations standards (August 2018)
Drafting new legislation framework for legal aid	Ankara: Consultation Meetings 04.05.2018 11.05.2018 24.05.2018 28.05.2018 30.05.2018 08.06.2018 18.06.2018 28.06.2018 Ankara: Stakeholders Meeting 30.06.2018- 01.07.2018	New Legislation of Legal Aid	Draft: 02.07.2018 Final.:30.07.2018	

Progress towards results

Tailor-made training modules

The training materials were revised as per the feedback received from pilot delivery, revised versions presented to the Consultation Group and the Heads of Trainee Education Commissions of 79 Bar Associations in İzmir on 12-13 May 2018. Also, the manual of the training modules was drafted for the bar association to present the inherit of the training, implementation technics and recommendation for the realization of the modules depending on the needs and reality of each region. The manual was prepared for the easy and future usage of the modules by bar associations. Manual includes notes for the trainer, inputs for each priority area (women, children, disabled people, LGBTI, refugees), speaking and presentation notes and practical information for the trainers.

Final outputs of the component have been the tailor-made guidelines for CCP attorneys on legal aid in line with European and United Nations standards along with proposals on necessary amendments to relevant legislation for improved legal aid services for disadvantaged groups. The guidelines have been finalized by August 2018.

New Activity: Drafting the new legislative framework for legal aid

The last version of the legislative framework of legal aid was presented to all stakeholders during the meeting on 30 June - 1 July 2018 with the participation of 57 representatives from Ministry of Justice,

UTBA and Bar Associations. Therefore, in line with the comments, inputs and recommendation of participants in this meeting, consultants revised the document which is submitted to all relevant project partners.

Analysis Section:

- 1- In May 2019, new Judicial Reform Strategy Programme of Turkish Government benefitted from the Legal Aid Strategy Plan of the Project significantly.
- 2- New legislation recommendation was prepared according to the findings of the Needs Assessment and Recommendation Report as well as feedback from the participants of the trainings. The legislative recommendations are complementary to the output of new activity on drafting the new legislative framework for legal aid. Basic recommendation headlines are:
 - Fees of the lawyers
 - Accessing legal services
 - Legal aid budget allocation
 - Training of the lawyer
 - Accessibility of Court Process

Result III - Improved Performance System for Legal Aid Services

Activities and dates		Outputs and dates		Result
Consultation Group Meeting to discuss the Comparative Analysis Report and first draft of the performance criteria and evaluation model	1st Meeting: 22.08.2017 2nd Meeting: 19 September 2018 3rd Meeting: 14 November 2018	Comparative analysis report on the monitoring and evaluation of the quality of legal aid services	Final: September 2018	Improved Performance System for Legal Aid Services (<i>April 2019</i>) Comparative Analysis Report (<i>April 2019</i>) Regional Meetings Report (<i>14 January 2019 final meeting</i>)
		First draft of the performance criteria of the attorneys performing legal aid in line with EU and UN standards First draft of the evaluation model over legal aid practices in Turkey to be considered by UTBA and bar associations	Final: September 2018	
7 regional meetings with the representatives of Bar Associations to discuss the draft performance criteria and	Antalya: 28 September 2018 Istanbul: 5 October 2018 Gaziantep: 02 November 2018 Samsun: 09	Revised draft of the performance criteria and evaluation model based on the findings of the regional meetings and consultative meetings	Final: January 2019	Consultation Group Meetings Report

evaluation model.	November 2018 Konya: 16 November 2018 Ankara: 17 November 2018 Manisa: 23 November 2018 Malatya: 14 January 2019	with Consultation Group		
		Finalize the performance criteria and evaluation model	Final: April 2019	

Progress towards results

A widely cited issue during the interviews conducted in the field visits by all actors in the justice field, the lack of performance criteria for attorneys in order to monitor and assess the quality of services provided by them for legal aid is a sensitive topic that was considered in this project. A national consultant, Ms. Gülriz Uygur who is professional on ethics and a national consultant aware of UTBA needs and expectations, professional in rule of law Mr. Musa Toprak has been recruited and drafted a comparative analysis report on the monitoring and evaluation of the quality of legal aid services and performance criteria and another report on evaluation model over legal aid practices in Turkey, in line with EU and UN standards. The first report served as a basis to develop the first draft of the performance criteria and evaluation model and discuss the issue with the Consultation Group. This first draft was presented to Bar Associations throughout Turkey via 7 regional meetings, given above, where participants provided their feedback and suggestions on the draft, with a high level of enthusiasm and ownership of the criteria in the process. The comparative analysis report and performance criteria have also been presented during the consultation group meetings held in the last period of 2018. Feedbacks of UTBA and the Bar Associations throughout Turkey provided their suggestions as to its benefits and use. Following the realization of Malatya Regional Meeting, final drafts of the reports have been prepared. With the approval of project partners in April 2019, the reports have been finalized. However, dissemination and promotion of the performance criteria among the lawyers is also a must for internalization process which requires a high level of responsiveness and ownership of the bar associations. According to the previous experiences of the stakeholders and as it was foreseen as a risk at the beginning of the project, it is possible that the lawyers could misinterpret the performance criteria as if it is a disciplinary issue and their independence and autonomy would be imperiled. It is obvious that this issue needs special attention and during regional meetings in 2018 special attention was reflected for the promotion of the performance criteria by emphasizing that the performance criteria and evaluation mechanism will not be a disciplinary issue and it is an important tool to raise the quality of the legal aid services. Feedbacks of the participants were delivered through satisfaction report with below details. Since the SILA project received an extension until May 2019 in which the last regional meeting in Malatya was conducted, there will be the dissemination of the finalized performance criteria as one of the components of the SILA Phase II Project.

19 September 2018 – 2nd Consultation meeting

The second consultation meeting of the SILA Project was organized with the participation of UTBA, the Ministry of Justice, UNDP and 6 pilot bar associations in the scope of the discussion of the Performance Criteria for Lawyers Performing Legal Aid under Component 3 of the project. The meeting included the presentation and evaluation of Comparative Analysis Report on Monitoring and Evaluation of Legal Aid Services and presentation and evaluation of Draft Performance Evaluation Criteria Conforming with the EU and UN Standards.

14 November 2018 – 3rd Consultation meeting

SILA Project 3rd Consultation Group meeting, which was held for the purpose of discussing the Performance Criteria for Lawyers Performing Legal Aid under Component 3 of the Project, was organized with the participation of UTBA, Ministry of Justice, UNDP and 6 pilot bar associations. During the meeting, recommendations and feedback were received from the participants as the two reports of Component III regarding Performance Criteria and Analysis Report on Monitoring and Evaluation of Legal Aid Services were presented and explained article by article.

Total of 106 feedbacks were received

(5 point: best, 1 Point= worst)

Questions	Average
1. The training was satisfactory and I improved my knowledge	4.22
2. Methodology of the study was proper	4.46
3. Performance of the experts for leading the discussions was satisfactory	4.34
4. Distributed materials were satisfactory and eased my learning process.	4.25
5. Group works on ethic principles was satisfactory	4.52
6. Logistics (accommodation, meals, transfers etc.) were satisfactory	4.63
7. Time duration of the meeting was enough	4.36

News were published by Manisa Bar Association regarding the regional meeting held on 23 November 2018 under Component III of the Project.

Component III Regional Meetings and Participant Statistics:

Antalya Regional Meeting: Total of 56 participants (25 women, 31 men)

Istanbul Regional Meeting: Total of 25 participants (13 women, 12 men)

Gaziantep Regional Meeting: Total of 40 participants (7 women, 33 men)

Samsun Regional Meeting: Total of 34 participants (18 women, 16 men)

Konya Regional Meeting: Total of 22 participants (7 women, 15 men)

Ankara Regional Meeting: Total of 25 participants (9 women, 16 men)

Manisa Regional Meeting: Total of 36 participants (13 women, 23 men)

As a result, during the regional meetings of Component III, the draft Performance Criteria, Comparative Analysis Report grabbed the attention of bar associations and attorneys. Regulating performance criteria is an ongoing debate, with this in mind, the ILAP (SILA Phase II) project document has been prepared and submitted according to the specific requirements and needs considering Turkey's legal context.

Result IV - Enhanced Coordination and Cooperation among the Attorneys Practicing Legal Aid

The activities under this component have been reported in the previous progress report. There are no additional activities carried out between July 2018- May 2019.

Result V - Legal aid needs underpinned, and services improved in the southern provinces of Turkey including Gaziantep, Hatay, Osmaniye, Şanlıurfa, Kilis and Kahramanmaraş

Activities and Dates		Outputs and Dates		Results
Preparation of trainer handbooks regarding the trainings of legal aid practices for disadvantaged groups	Final: 15 August 2018	Publication and Distribution of 4100 Trainer Handbooks to 79 Bar Associations	Final: 29 April 2019	Handbooks have been distributed to 79 bar associations via courier services. (May 2019)

Progress towards the results

The trainer handbooks regarding the trainings of legal aid practices for disadvantaged groups which have been prepared under Component V in August 2017 by the experts of project (*Musa Toprak, Ardahan Şenyuva, Cengiz Hakan Aydın*) were finalized as of April 2018. Following the approval received by donor during project extension period until May 2019, those handbooks were printed and distributed to 79 Bar Associations in Turkey in order to increase the knowledge of bar associations on those modules, information sharing and enable the bar associations to use them during their internal trainings, in case needed. A total of 4100 handbooks were printed distributed by the end of April 2019.

Inception Period (Annex IV)

Within the scope of Inception Period, visits to pilot cities of Samsun, Nevşehir, Denizli, Rize, Balıkesir, Mardin and Antalya was organized in order to analyze in the field and conduct a needs assessment study. A team of experts composed of 5 women and 2 men did research in the field. Mission teams to pilot provinces also included representatives from UTBA and Ministry of Justice. The UNDP Project Team was always present during field visits. The UNDP Project Team supervised and closely monitored all missions to pilot provinces.

Details of the visits to the pilot provinces are as follows:

Pilot Province	Visited Institutions (Please see Annex IV for detailed information)	Key Findings
Samsun: 4-7 February 2019 (4 female, 5 male participants)	Samsun Bar Association, Chief Public Prosecutor, Provincial Directorate of the Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services of Samsun, Samsun Governor, Provincial Police Department of Samsun, Samsun Gendarmerie Command and various NGOs	<p>All the committees and commissions of the Samsun Bar Association have shown positive approaches due to the implementation of this project in their Bar Association.</p> <p>The Bar Association did not have much corporate work with NGOs, but the Boards of local bars and the women rights Centres frequently met with NGOs and held panels, meetings and information work.</p>
Nevşehir: 18-20 February 2019 (5 female, 3 male participants)	Nevşehir Bar Association, Nevşehir Governorship, Provincial Directorate of the Ministry of Family, Chief Public Prosecutor, Provincial Police Department, Nevşehir Gendarmerie Command, Hacı Bektaş Veli University, various NGOs	<p>It was observed that the Bar Association is located within the courthouse, that there is no separate service building, that the current situation is enough for the service according to their statements and that there is no meeting room to be used for training meetings.</p> <p>The Bar Association's Women, and Children Rights Boards work actively. the President of the Bar Association and the Board of Directors are working in coordination with public institutions and NGOs.</p>
Denizli: 25-28 February 2019 (8 female, 5 male participants)	Denizli Bar Association, Denizli Governorship, Chief Public Prosecutor, Provincial Directorate of the Ministry of Family, Provincial Police Department, Denizli Gendarmerie Command, various NGOs	<p>It was observed that the main service building of the Bar Association of Denizli is located within the courthouse and it was determined that it is appropriate to establish SÖM (Şiddet Önleme Merkezi in Turkish) within the Bar facilities and necessary and enough area will be formed as a result of feasibility.</p> <p>The active work of female lawyers carrying out these duties and especially working in the field of women's right will provide facilitation in carrying out the works planned under the Project due to the fact that they previously received Poppy Training¹ and continue their work, that these lawyers occasionally participated in in-service training and gender equality training but that the lawyers who will work under the Project should be retrained under the training programme that we will</p>

¹ Poppy Training was initiated by Ankara bar association to provide legal aid services for vulnerable group especially women through volunteer work of lawyers which will be improved and disseminated in this project

		determine regardless of the previous training.
Rize: 4-6 March 2019 (8 female, 4 male participants)	Rize Bar Association, Rize Governorship, Rize Police Department, Gendarmerie Command of Rize, Chief Public Prosecutor, Provincial Directorate of Family and Social Policies, various NGOs	It was stated and determined that drug abuse is the first in Rize and sexual abuse is the second according to the rankings of crime, that 70% of incoming abuse related reports are from teachers, that drug users are also criminal offenders, A small number of lawyers work on the boards due to the small number of lawyers, that there is a Legal Aid Centre but that citizens have difficulty in reaching legal aid, that victims have difficulty in collecting the necessary documents for benefiting from the legal aid system and therefore the victims sometimes change their mind on bringing an action, that the Bar Association's relationship with the Chief Public Prosecutor's Office is very good, that dialogues and collaboration with Governorship, Police Department, Gendarmerie and the Provincial Directorate of Family are very strong compared to other Bar Associations.
Balıkesir: 12-14 March 2019 (7 female, 6 male participants)	Balıkesir Bar Association, Balıkesir Governorship, Balıkesir Police Department, Gendarmerie Command of Balıkesir, Chief Public Prosecutor, Provincial Directorate of Family and Social Policies, various NGOs	<p>NGOs were kept behind in the studies carried out between the Governorate and the other institutions; presentations were made by the institutions however monitoring on activities was not conducted and should be conducted;</p> <p>Communication between the Bar and NGO were personal than institutional and institutional relationship should be developed;</p> <p>Sexual abuse and incest cases could be observed in almost every school;</p> <p>Rates of divorce was high in the city due to early marriage; marrying at the age of 14-15 was generally considered normal, therefore, girls were escaping for marriage.</p> <p>Balıkesir was the 5th province in femicide rates.</p>

Mardin: 18-20 March 2019 (8 female, 3 male participants)	Mardin Bar Association, Governorship of Mardin, Provincial Police Department of Mardin, Provincial Directorate of Family and Social Policies, various NGOs	Legal Aid, CCP Centres and Internship Commissions, Women and Children's Rights Committees are active, that legal aid services are only given to women, that legal aid payments are made once a year and the allowance is insufficient, that all of the applicants could not be answered for this reason, that requests for judicial assistance are generally rejected, that there is no tailor-made training for attorneys attending legal aid, the attorneys taking part in the legal aid service primarily consider it as a source of income and a means to gain experience but attorneys included in the list show more attention to legal aid files and that they think that the applicants who have already been victims have more need for an attorney, that no legal aid course is provided during internship, that no updating training is provided by those who work at the committees
Antalya: (7 female, 6 male participants)	Antalya Bar Association	Bar Association has boards of women, children and human rights and Legal Aid and CCP Center. It has been identified that the Bar is generally sensitive to women's rights and showing the number of personnel, where 29 of 33 are women by making positive discrimination. Unlike the other Bars, it has a Board of Women Rights instead of the Board of Women Rights and Gender Equality; the number of male lawyers is more than female lawyers, however, female lawyers are more active in the boards of the Bar; Coordination Centre was established to ensure coordination between different boards unlike the other Bars; they try to operate the coordination center, which was established within the scope of the European Union Project; Board of Women Rights and Gender Equality has a magazine, trainings on women, children, human and refugee rights were delivered even they were not regular and planned.

General Assessment of the Project Results

The first result of the Project which is the improvement of the automation system for appointment of Code of Criminal Procedure (CCP) attorneys was an important enhancement of the system. Although the system did not go operational, the improvement of the system was beneficial according to practicing attorneys. However, some bar associations were not ready to integrate the system. Furthermore, an internal regulatory framework was submitted to UTBA for future utilization.

The second result was crucial for the capacity development of lawyers practicing legal aid for disadvantaged groups. The tailor-made guidelines for CCP attorneys in line with European and United Nations standards were produced. UTBA successfully owned these modules and disseminated to bar associations. Within the scope of the second result of the project, also studies were conducted in terms of legal aid legislation in order to improve legal aid services for disadvantaged groups. These studies were conducted jointly between the SILA Project and Ministry of Justice's Twinning Project for Legal Aid. As a result of the studies and meetings, creating an inclusive draft legal aid legislation was decided. The draft legislation was approved by the Minister of Justice. The draft legislation successfully reached the Turkish Parliament. The Ministry of Justice later informed us that, the change of the Turkish Constitution caused the draft legislation to be either integrated in the system by judicial packages or by presidential decree. Since the draft legislation was decided by many legal practitioners and justice sector representatives it will be easily pass into law in future judicial packages. Conclusively, the second result of the project has significant importance for disadvantaged groups since the quality of service providers were developed, both in terms of consultancy services and professional skillset.

With the third result of the Project we aimed for the improvement of the performance system for legal aid services nationwide. Especially performance criteria was drafted for attorneys practising legal aid for enhancing monitoring and quality of services. A comparative analysis report on the monitoring and evaluation of the quality of legal aid services and performance criteria and another report on evaluation model over legal aid practices in Turkey were produced, in line with European Union and United Nations standards. Adaptation of the performance criteria is continuing.

As for the fourth result of the Project coordination and cooperation among attorneys practising legal aid was achieved. Justice sector representatives and civil society representatives were brought together by regional meetings. Total of 111 judges and prosecutors, 97 attorneys, 65 civil society organization representatives, 7 social workers and psychologists, 4 representatives from Directorate General of Migration Management participated to 6 regional meetings in Balıkesir, Erzurum, Istanbul, Konya, Samsun, Şanlıurfa. Positive feedbacks have been received following the regional meetings, demonstrating the efficiency in raising awareness on the common problems and common solutions at regional level and providing an enabling environment for networking and exchange of information and experiences among different justice actors as well as civil society organization representatives.

The fifth result was important for identifying legal aid needs and improvement of services in Gaziantep, Hatay, Osmaniye, Şanlıurfa, Kilis and Kahramanmaraş. 63 consultation and focus group meetings were held in before mentioned provinces. Semi-structured interviews and focus groups were organized with bar associations, legal aid units, legal aid lawyers, judges, prosecutors, both national and international institutions. In total, 192 individuals (109 men and 83 women) were interviewed. According to the findings of these activities, gaps of the legal aid system in Turkey, areas where improvement is required and reforms including professional development of lawyers, problematic issues of the attitudes and behavior of the service providers were identified. Furthermore, the requirements of the Syrian population in terms of legal protection were

clarified. The drafted strategy report and road map within the scope of the fifth result were shared in the printed handbooks. In total 4100 handbooks were distributed to 79 bar associations nationwide.

Lessons Learned

Adoption of the automation system and performance criteria could have been organized and communicated differently. There was a rush in delivering the changes and suggested developments regarding these subjects. Due to these reasons, the presentation of these two topics could be spread through time and delivered in different intervals during the project time plan. As for the visibility of the project on the internet, a creation of a website could have been better planned with specifications and technical capacity of servers in mind. Instead of a conservative communications strategy, an innovative communication plan could have been implemented.

Union of Turkish Bar Associations Women's Law Commission's (TÜBAKKOM) involvement in the first phase was low, because they do not have any staff members and communicating project progress was difficult during project implementation. Moreover, the miscommunication between UTBA and TÜBAKKOM was another obstacle for their involvement. TÜBAKKOM is composed of representatives of Bar Associations' Women Rights Commissions. In the following project, TÜBAKKOM's involvement will be ensured by strengthening coordination and communication through the commission representatives. They will be invited to all coordination meetings and advisory committees.

In terms of improving future programming, for a similar project of this caliber, the development impact could be shared with the public, especially end beneficiaries of such services, through a better informative campaign embedded in an efficient communication strategy. This is important also for building a strong dialogue with stakeholders, especially for representatives of civil society and legal practitioners. When a new concept or new methodology is introduced it will take time for the society and practitioners to accept them, therefore activities should be designed for achievable results. Time plan should be designed with the risks kept in mind. Lastly, in projects categorized high in terms of impact on gender equality, gender mainstreaming should be included in monitoring mechanisms. Throughout annual reporting, gender mainstreaming and achievements should be explained in detail. In order to obtain gender disaggregated and responsive data, partners should be well informed beforehand, and activities should be planned with these in mind.

Follow-up Actions

Throughout SILA Phase I, mainly four areas required further improvement for better legal aid services. These are respectively, coordination between stakeholders, structured system for services provision, capacity development of service providers and awareness raising on performance management and evaluation mechanisms.

In the second phase of this project the performance criteria are going to be marketed through the specifically designed communication plan. It was obvious that the criteria should be delivered in a smooth manner, by waiting the stakeholders to absorb the new mentality shift, because the criteria will be a code of conduct for the legal practitioners. The communication plan envisages including the criteria in pilot provinces where criteria could be practiced in a small area under local bar associations. Furthermore, raising awareness among legal practitioners by organizing events and publishing materials for distribution.

Enhancing coordination could be achieved by bringing bar associations and NGOs together, and facilitate sharing their experiences. This would be beneficial for vulnerable groups seeking legal aid. Creation of a structured system is essential for a well-functioning legal aid system. Involvement of all institutions and civil

society should be the main goal. Cooperation is key here. In terms of capacity development, lawyers need professional trainings. The rules, regulations and country context is dynamic, for this reason they need to be up to par with developments legally. Additionally, they need technique-oriented trainings for qualified services. Finally, organizing informative campaigns within the framework of awareness raising is crucial for both stakeholders and beneficiaries, most importantly vulnerable groups. In the future more time and activities will be dedicated to the communications campaign.

Unforeseen Results

1) 2019 Judicial Reform Strategy Paper: A strategic road map was produced during the implementation of the SILA Project. This road map was presented to UTBA (Union of Turkish Bar Association) in order to support the enhancement of the quality of the legal aid system in Turkey. The road map included solutions to systemic problems. Some strategical points of the road map were included in the 2019 Judicial Reform Strategy Paper. Please find the analysis of the points below:

1. **Page 11, number 33:** In the current legal context, ‘preventive justice’ or ‘protective justice’ has become a concept which embodies many other legal applications. The focus within these concepts are solving disagreements and finding practical solutions to disagreements. This document sets out goals in chapters for strengthening the right of defense, legal profession, the legal aid system and notary services.

2. **Page 15, number 56:** Important steps has been taken for improving access to justice. The legal aid budget has systematically increased since the last reporting period. While the legal aid budget was 362.681.936,00 TL in 2015, in 2018 it increased to 494.935.162,30 TL. Furthermore, the Twinning Project which took place between 2016 and 2018 was important for identifying the gaps in the legal aid system. The Ministry of Justice agreed to complete this Twinning Project (Strengthening of Legal Aid Services in Turkey) in conjunction with SILA Phase I Project. The Antalya Conference organized during SILA Phase I Project had a direct impact on the budget increase.

3. **Page 61, last paragraph of the first column of Strategy Paper:** This was particularly emphasized in SILA Project’s 5th component trainings.

4. **Page 66, second column last paragraph:** Legal aid is the exemption from legal fees and expenses and the appointment of a free lawyer by the bar association for people with inadequate financial means. Strengthening the legal aid system is an important indicator that the system is human oriented. Regarding this, works will be carried out to strengthen the legal aid system within the scope of this Strategy Document. Facilitation of the application procedure, creation of standard forms for applicants and the possibility of applying via e-Government will be among the prominent works." These are the objectives highlighted under SILA. In particular, the application via e-government is highlighted in both the 5th component and the Performance Criteria meetings.

5. **Page 67, first column second paragraph:** Arrangements that envision positive discrimination against women in access to justice are of great importance. Another group that is sensitive topic is the elderly. These measures are becoming increasingly common throughout the world. During the period of this Strategy Document, applications will be developed in our country. Facilitation of the legal aid system will be one of these applications." Gender was especially emphasized in all components and trainings of SILA. The fifth component trainings are focused on this topic and the highlights made on the topics as well as the strategy document are very similar.

6. **Page 68, Goal 6.2:** The legal aid system will be strengthened for effective access to justice. All activities are in line with SILA's objectives, with emphasis on vulnerable groups.

7. **Page 68, Goal 6.4:** Practices related to women's rights will be developed in the justice system. All the activities, in particularly emphasis on women are in line with the UNDCS outcomes in project document and objectives of SILA Project.

2) Incorporation of a new activity, a new legislation framework for legal aid was drafted (Twinning Project, May – June 2018):

SILA Project and the Twinning Project, which UTBA was a part of, benefitted from each other's results. For this reason, meetings were held in order to share project processes, outputs and discuss recent developments in the framework of access to justice and legal aid. After these meetings, UTBA and Ministry of Justice suggested to add a new activity to SILA Project for the development of a new legislation framework for legal aid.

This new activity provided support for elimination of the gaps and needs to achieve an effective functioning legal aid system and enhance access to justice in Turkey. New legislation framework had a wider approach and aims to compensate the needs and expectation of the beneficiaries of the legal aid system as well as service providers. In total, 8 consultation meetings were organized with the participation of representatives from UTBA, Ministry of Justice, Twinning Project and UNDP. These were all completed by June 2018.

The new legislation framework contained the following:

- Obstacles of obtaining warrant document from notary. (Some vulnerable groups such as refugees could not obtain warrant for their lawyers from notary because of lacking financial capabilities. The new framework aims to ease the process and contains new solutions to overcome this problem.
- Assessment of vulnerable groups were included in the new framework. The list of vulnerable groups was taken from the report of the Ministry of Justice's, Justice Victims Right Department.
- Details of who may benefit from legal aid systems. The new legislation was drafted in line with the UYAP.

3) United Nation Joint Programme Project called “Enhancing Access to Justice and Legal Aid for Refugees in Turkey”:

The research carried out under the fifth component of SILA Project created an opportunity for the implementation of a new project under the United Nations Joint Programme. Refugees were facing problems accessing justice and legal aid, and these problems fell under the scope of both UNDP and UNHCR strategies. For this reason, UNDP, UNHCR and Ministry of Justice implemented the “Enhancing Access to Justice and Legal Aid for Refugees in Turkey” Project. The project started in September 2018 and ended in December 2019. Trainings were provided to justice sector actors and awareness raising activities were organized for refugees during the implementation of this project. During the trainings the following subjects were presented:

- Social integration of refugees in host communities,
- Interviewing techniques with children during judicial processes,
- Principles of refugee law and international protection,
- Presentation of the Ministry of Justice's new initiatives; Judicial Support and Victims' Rights Directories and Forensic Interview Rooms in courthouses

During awareness raising activities, refugees were informed by both UNHCR and the representative from Ministry of Justice – Directorate of Victims' Rights about stopping child marriages, legal procedures that need to be followed during divorce, differences of Syrian and Turkish law in terms of implementation, women and children rights, and their rights and obligations as refugees in their country of asylum.

ii) Indicator Based Performance Assessment:

Original Indicators ²	Achieved Indicator Targets	Source of Verification
<i>Outcome I- Improved Automation System for Appointment of Code of Criminal Procedure (CCP) Attorneys (Annex I)</i>		- Draft Legislation Document for Automation System
50% of Bar Associations adopted the new Automation System successfully by 2018	Not Achieved. The bar associations were not ready to adopt the new automation system to be initiated. During İzmir meeting under Outcome I, draft regulation system was presented by IC recruited by UNDP. During her presentation some resistance was received by the representatives of bar associations. As this indicator could not be achieved without the full support of the local bars, UTBA suggested to further discuss this indicator. Therefore, due to the current local resistance, this indicator target could not be achieved.	- Meeting minutes
Gradual increase in uniformity in legal aid practices in criminal cases ensured	Not Achieved. The concept of “uniformity” was not operationalized at the beginning of the project. Besides, standardization of practices met with resistance among Bars so even with enough operationalization of this indicator, it would not have been achieved.	
Disaggregated data on disadvantaged groups explored through updated Automation System	Not Achieved, could not be measured. As detailed above, adaptation of bar associations on improved automation system for CCP attorneys cannot be achieved which led to failure in its interrelated activities such as collection of disaggregated data. Each bar association has their own system while appointing a CCP lawyers of the people in need and recording of this procedure is not systematized well-structured or controlled by a centralized authority. On the other hand, UTBA is eager to receive the disaggregated data which will also serve for the needs of bar associations while discussing the needs and future improvements on legal system	

² Some of the indicators selected to gauge project performance such as “number of disadvantaged groups benefitting from legal aid”, “the percentage increase in the number of platforms organized by UTBA / bar associations for exchange of experience among legal aid practitioners”, “number of citizens/residents benefitting from legal aid services in referred provinces”, “percentage increase in the number of the legal aid attorneys increased in respective provinces”, “percentage increase in the number of the legal aid attorneys in referred provinces benefitting from the tailor-made trainings” and “percentage increase in the number of civil society organizations at the local level participating to the coordination meetings” could not be measured. This is because some of the baselines were either not known (i.e baseline figure of attorneys practicing legal aid in that province or baseline level of number of platforms organized by UTBA before the project started) or data was not collected systematically by bars or shared with UNDP (in the case of number of legal aid applications) due to sensitivities. Due to this reason, there is sometimes an incongruence with what the original indicator is asking for and what UNDP has been able to gather under “achieved indicator targets”. The Final Report should be evaluated under this light.

	with the support Ministry of Justice. However, as numerical, gender based, age-based data is very hard to collect from bar associations and they are not willing to change the system fully, exploring the disadvantaged groups benefiting from legal aid is very hard. Further discussions and improvement of bar association systems need to be done. In second phase, through establish ŞÖM centers in 7 pilot bars, by using a standardized recording on people who are applying for legal aid, disaggregated data will be collected. This is also an indicator for Legal Aid Phase II project.	
<u>Baseline:</u> 77 Bar Associations using the automation system as of 2014	<i>Current Status</i> -New legislation for the usage of automation system was developed and presented to 79 bar associations which will ensure to collect disaggregated data on disadvantaged groups through Automation System. -Problems of CCP system and appointment of attorneys for CCP cases were identified and discussed with the stakeholders. -New automation regulation was finalized but was not approved by UTBA and it needs to be revised again.	
<i>Outcome II – Enhanced Capacity of the Attorneys Practicing Legal Aid for Disadvantaged Groups</i>		-Meeting minutes and activity reports
Number of the disadvantaged groups benefitted from legal aid increased by 20% by 2017. ³	- Needs Assessment and Recommendations Report for Enhancing the Capacity of Legal Aid Lawyers to Provide Services to Disadvantaged Groups was prepared. - 294 lawyers from 79 bar association participated to the tailor-made trainings targeted to improve skills and knowledge on disadvantaged groups for providing legal services.	- Recommendation of new legislation report -New draft legislation document on legal aid.
Guidelines disseminated among 4000 attorneys, judges and prosecutors in Turkey	Guidelines have been prepared and presented for the review of the stakeholders by 3 rd Quarter of 2018.	
Gradual increase in the number of Bar Associations that incorporate tailor-made training modules into the curriculum of trainee attorneys	- Tailor-made training modules and needs assessment report were presented to representatives of Ministry of Justice, UTBA and 79 heads of the education commissions of Bar associations by 2 nd quarter of 2018. 79 bars benefited from the trainings and declared that this will be very useful while providing legal aid services for disadvantaged groups.	- Needs Assessment and Recommendations Report

³ Please refer to footnote 2 for the incongruence

Improved legal aid practices for disadvantaged groups by a directive of UTBA	-294 lawyers from 79 bar association participated to the tailor-made trainings targeted to improve skills and knowledge on disadvantaged groups for providing legal services.	-Training feedback report - Comparative Report about the Trainings of Component II
Continued cooperation/exchange of experience between UTBA and its equivalents in other countries	Study tours were organized to Canada and Italy. Mutual communication and know-how process were realized during the study tours with the counterparts of the UTBA and its equivalents in other countries.	
Enhanced awareness of judges and prosecutors on legal aid.	<p>-111 judges and prosecutors, 97 attorneys, 65 civil society organization representatives, 7 social workers and psychologists, 4 representatives from Directorate General of Migration Management participated to 6 regional meetings under Component IV.</p> <p>-Awareness of lawyers, prosecutors, judges, UTBA and NGOs was raised about the regional problems on legal aid and possible solutions including new cooperation and partnership fields were explored.</p> <p>-Recommendation of solutions for the common problems on legal aid at the regional level was prepared within the cooperation of UTBA, MoJ, NGOs.</p>	
Level of incorporation of the proposals to the legislative amendments on legal aid.	<p>-Legislative amendments were prepared and presented to the stakeholders for the review.</p> <p>-New legislation framework of legal aid was prepared with the participation of UTBA, MoJ and UNDP in 8 consultative meetings. New legislation framework presented to all stakeholders during the meeting on 30 June-1 July 2018 with the participation of 57 representatives from Ministry of Justice, UTBA and Bar associations. The Minister approved the draft legislation but it is not came into force yet.</p> <p>- Strategy paper and the Roadmap prepared under Component V during the implementation of SILA project has significantly served for the inclusion of some strategical points in Judicial Reform Strategy Paper 2019 described above.</p>	
Coordination between MoJ and UTBA enhanced through a mutual share of data on legal aid services	<p>-Recommendation for the new legal aid legislation was prepared within the cooperation of MoJ, UTBA and UNDP</p> <p>-Representatives of the Ministry of Justice and UTBA provided substantial inputs to the training modules and need assessment report.</p> <p>-Wage scale of Code of Criminal Procedure (CCP - CMK) was raised by 7.10% in 2018, compared to 2017, by MoJ depending on the findings and reviews of the UTBA about the current situation concerning the budget. <i>(The wage increase continued in the following years. In 2019 the increase was 12.38% compared to</i></p>	

	2018, and 18.60% compared to 2017)	
<u>Baseline:</u> Targeted trainings on legal aid services for disadvantaged groups are limited Current legislation frameworks on legal aid lack dimension on disadvantaged groups		
<i>Outcome III - Improved Performance Evaluation System for Legal Aid Services (Annex III)</i>		
Principle decision of UTBA for enhancing the quality of legal aid through new performance criteria	- Achieved. Draft and final performance criteria were developed. The document was revised and finalized after the regional meetings. It is still being reviewed.	
Tools for evaluation of legal aid services by citizens encouraged through a directive of UTBA by 79 bar associations.	- Achieved. Dissemination of the performance criteria will be the base for SILA-Phase 2 project which is expected to start in July 2019.	
New performance criteria adopted by more bar associations compared to the current situation	- Achieved. New Performance criteria were introduced to 7 pilot bar associations (while there was no information among the bar associations at all) and their feedback were received during the provincial meetings.	
Improved performance of attorneys considering the feedback of the bar associations, that adopted the new performance criteria	- Achieved. As there is no legally binding step initiated by MoJ or bar associations itself, the performance criteria were not adapted, only introduced. This indicator was achieved during the implementation of the project and will have an ongoing impact for the component of Legal Aid Phase II Project. Second phase will focus on dissemination of the performance criteria for all bar association and increasing their awareness.	
<u>Baseline:</u> No baseline		
<i>Outcome IV - Enhanced Coordination and Cooperation among the Attorneys Practicing Legal Aid</i>		- Meeting minutes and activity reports. - Attending lists of each regional meeting.
Number of the visitors of the website reached 1 million thresholds by 2017	Not Achieved. The project website was established but number of visitors were not achieved to 1 million by 2017.	
The number of platforms organized by UTBA / bar	Partially Achieved because it is not fully measurable. By referring to the 6 regional	

associations for exchange of experience among legal aid practitioners increased by 30% annually ⁴	meetings held under this component with participations of NGO's, lawyers, public prosecutors and judges, it can be indicated that there was experience sharing, exchange of ideas, measuring the current legal problems in the field was possible where lessons learned from past experiences were shared. However, annual comparison and measurable data in terms of percentage cannot be achieved.	
REVISED: 300 lawyers, representatives of Ministry of Justice, UTBA, NGOs and DGMM participated in the regional meetings called "Common Problems, Common Solutions"	<p>-111 judges and prosecutors, 97 attorneys, 65 civil society organization representatives, 7 social workers and psychologists, 4 representatives from Directorate General of Migration Management participated to 6 regional meetings</p> <p>-Recommendation of solutions for the common problems on legal aid at regional level was prepared within the cooperation of UTBA, MoJ, NGOs.</p> <p>-Mutual understanding and communication were established between Bar Associations and NGOs.</p> <p>-Awareness of lawyers, prosecutors, judges, UTBA and NGOs was raised about the regional problems on legal aid and possible solutions including new cooperation and partnership fields were explored.</p> <p>-Results of the regional meetings served as an input to the Strategy Paper and Road Map for UTBA prepared under the Component V.</p>	
<u>Baseline:</u> Website of UTBA Website of 79 Bar Associations 5 coordination meetings organized for legal aid in 2014		
<i>Outcome V– Legal aid needs underpinned, and services improved in the southern provinces of Turkey including Gaziantep, Hatay, Şanlıurfa, Kilis and Kahramanmaraş (Annex II)</i>		-Advisory Committee meetings report.
Number of citizens/residents benefitted from legal aid services in referred provinces increased by 40% ⁵ .	-Partially achieved. Needs Assessment and Recommendations Report was finalized, obstacles of providing legal aid services for disadvantaged groups concerning approach of service providers and stakeholders such as lawyers, judges, prosecutors,	- Strategy Paper and Road Map document for

⁴ Please refer to footnote 2 for the incongruence

⁵ Please refer to footnote 2 for the incongruence

Number of the legal aid attorneys increased in respective provinces by 40% by the end of 2017 ⁶ .	<p>security forces and training needs for the lawyers were identified. However, due to sensitivity of the issue and lack of regular data collection by bar associations, number of citizens/residents benefitted from legal aid services in referred provinces increased by 40%. Therefore, <i>Relevant data could not be received by local bars of 2017.</i></p> <p>-228 lawyers and intern lawyers participated in the trainings were held in Hatay, Osmaniye, Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, and Kahramanmaraş.</p>	<p>UTBA</p> <p>- Needs Assessment Recommendations Report</p> <p>-Meeting minutes and activity reports</p> <p>-Brief Report on Impressions from the Trainings and Lessons Learned</p>
50% of the legal aid attorneys in referred provinces benefitted from the tailor-made trainings ⁷	<p>-Training needs of lawyers for legal aid services for Syrian Refugees was identified.</p> <p>-228 lawyers and intern lawyers participated in the trainings were held in Hatay, Osmaniye, Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, and Kahramanmaraş</p>	
Number of the residents of 5 provinces consulted about the current situation / legal needs	<p>-63 consultation and focus group meetings were held in pilot provinces of the Project (Hatay, Osmaniye, Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa ve Kahramanmaraş)</p> <p>-Semi-structured interviews and focus groups were made with bar associations, legal aid units, legal aid lawyers, judges, and prosecutors, national and international institution including NGOs. In total, 192 people (109 men and 83 women) were interviewed.</p>	
Number of the legal issues discussed and solved/ guided by the Task Force		
80% of the civil society organizations at the local level participated in the coordination meetings ⁸	<p>-Semi-structured interviews and focus groups were made with bar associations, legal aid units, legal aid lawyers, judges, and prosecutors, national and international institution including NGOs. In total, 192 people (109 men and 83 women) were interviewed.</p> <p>-3 Advisory Committee meetings were organized with the participation of NGOs, UTBA, MoJ and UNDP.</p>	
80% of the actions proposed under the Strategy Paper realized by UTBA by the end of 2017	-Achieved.Strategy Paper and Road Map was prepared and approved by UTBA in principle.	

⁶ Please refer to footnote 2 for the incongruence

⁷ Please refer to footnote 2 for the incongruence

⁸ Please refer to footnote 2 for the incongruence

iii) Success Story

- New legislation for the usage of automation system was developed and presented to 79 bar associations by UTBA which will ensure to collect disaggregated data on disadvantaged groups through the system,
- 294 lawyers from 79 bar associations participated in the tailor-made trainings targeted to improve skills and knowledge on disadvantaged groups in terms of providing legal services,
- Tailor-made training modules and need assessment report were presented to representatives of MoJ, UTBA and 79 of bar associations by 2nd quarter of 2018,
- Awareness of lawyers, prosecutors, judges, UTBA and NGOs were raised about regional problems on legal aid and possible solutions including the exploration of new cooperation and partnership areas,
- Recommendation of solutions for common problems on legal aid at the regional level was prepared in cooperation with UTBA, MoJ, NGOs,
- New legislation framework of legal aid was prepared,
- Wage scale of CCP (CMK) was raised by 7.10% in 2018 by MoJ based on the findings and recommendations,
- Draft of performance criteria were developed. The document was revised and finalized after regional meetings,
- Mutual understanding on the needs of disadvantaged groups need legal aid and an ongoing communication were established through regular meetings held under the project between Bar Associations and NGOs,
- Problems in providing legal aid services for disadvantaged groups were identified through needs assessment report. The report also highlighted the need for professional trainings for lawyers practising legal aid, especially for services towards refugees,
- 228 lawyers and intern lawyers participated in the trainings which were held in Hatay, Osmaniye, Gaziantep, Şanlıurfa, and Kahramanmaraş.

Throughout project implementation good dialogue was built with partners. The project team was able to create a qualified team of experts for the delivery of reports. Both good communication of activities and efficient implementation methodology designed with partners support the success. Project stakeholders such as justice sector actors, bar associations and NGOs were willing to help the project achieve its main aim, to strengthen legal aid practises in Turkey for the maintenance of rule of law. During the project cycle, partners and stakeholders worked collaboratively in order to develop the legal aid system in Turkey. Regional meetings and other organizations such as focus group discussions helped understand the gaps and problems within the system. The friendly environment created in these organizations made it easy for lawyers to share their experiences and views, therefore identifying problems and coming up with solutions became easier.

5. PROGRAMMATIC REVISIONS

The project was extended until March 2019, then by April 2019 and finally by May 2019. All extensions were applied to the project after obtaining SIDA's approval and no additional resources were required during any of these processes. The purpose was to complete all remaining project activities and initiate SILA Phase II Project studies. The regional meetings in Component III were not organized due to the busy schedules of project partner representatives and participants. Furthermore, reports produced by project experts required further review and examinations by project partners. The activities included in the extension period were coordination meetings, situation mapping and needs assessment studies in 7 provinces, needs assessment studies and preparation of a communication plan.

4. RESOURCES

ANNUAL WORKPLAN

Year: 2015

EXPECTED RESULTS <i>And</i> <i>baseline, indicators including annual targets</i>	PLANNED ACTIVITIES <i>List activity results and associated actions</i>	TIMEFRAME				RESPO NSIBLE PARTY	PLANNED BUDGET				
		Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4		Funding Source	Budget Description	Amount (USD)		
									Planned		Actual
Result I- Improved Automation System for Appointment of Code of Criminal Procedure (CCP) Attorneys	Conduct visits to 5 pilot local bar associations to assess the current situation and needs				X	UTBA UNDP	UTBA	Local Consultant (10 w/days- \$ 600 daily)	\$ 6,000	\$ 0	
								Travel & accommodation	\$ 10,000	\$ 0	
Result V- Legal aid needs underpinned and services improved in the southern provinces of Turkey including Gaziantep, Hatay, Kilis and Kahramanmaraş	Conduct visits to 2 local bar associations and interviews with attorneys/mukhtars/NG Os,etc				X	UTBA MoJ UNDP	UTBA	International Consultant (15 w/days- \$ 700 daily)	\$ 10,500	\$ 0	
								Local Consultant (10 w/days- \$ 600 daily)	\$ 6,000	\$ 0	
								Translation & Interpretation Services	\$ 9,500	\$ 0	

								Travel & accommodation	\$ 13,500	\$ 0
Project Manager (UNDP Cluster Leader)					X		UTBA		\$ 10,000	\$ 12,125.18
Project Associate					X		UTBA		\$ 8,000	
Project Support Staff Cost					X		UTBA		\$ 4,000	
M&E Specialist					X		UTBA		\$ 4,000	
Explanations of other activity related expenditure (Annex V)	Activity 6				X		UTBA	Sundry	\$ 0	\$ 283.08
								Reimbursement to UNDP for Support Services	\$ 0	\$ 13,917.33
								Travel		\$ 17.14
								Translation		\$ 625.19
								PR Cost		\$ 1,610.97
	Activity 1				X		UTBA	Equipment	\$ 0	\$ 855.29
					X		UTBA	Sundry	\$ 0	\$ 33.35
General Management Services & Support Cost (%8)	Overheads: General Management Services				X		UTBA		\$ 6,520	\$ 2,357.41
TOTAL									\$ 88,020	\$ 31,825.00

Year: 2016

EXPECTED RESULTS <i>And baseline, indicators including annual targets</i>	PLANNED ACTIVITIES <i>List activity results and associated actions</i>	TIMEFRAME				RESPONSIBLE PARTY	PLANNED BUDGET				
		Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4			Funding Source	Budget Description	Amount (USD)	
										Planned	Actual
Result I- Improved Automation System for Appointment of Code of Criminal Procedure (CCP) Attorneys	Conduct interviews with users of the Automation System	X				<i>UTBA UNDP</i>	<i>UTBA</i>	Local Consultant (15 w/days- \$ 600 daily)	\$ 9,000	\$ 6,135.60	
	Develop an assessment report including a set of recommendations for a better functioning Automation System	X				<i>UTBA UNDP</i>	<i>UTBA</i>	Local Consultant (15 w/days- \$ 600 daily)	\$ 9,000		
								Miscellaneous	\$ 2,000	\$ 501.15	
	Organize a technical workshop for the scale up of the automation system and possible internal regulation			X			<i>UTBA UNDP</i>	<i>SIDA</i>	Organizational Expenses (covering food & beverages; printing, hall rent, etc.) of 2 days workshop having 85 participants (Unit rate per participant is \$ 100)	\$ 17,000	\$ 1,614.16
									Travel & Accommodation	\$ 47,400	\$ 1,712.97

	Develop and widely disseminate a user-user-friendly guideline for the use of the updated system		X					Printing and dissemination	\$ 40,000	\$ 0
								Local Consultants (15 w/days- \$600 daily)	\$ 9,000	\$ 0
Result V- Legal aid needs underpinned and services improved in the southern provinces of Turkey including Gaziantep, Hatay, Kilis and Kahramanmaraş	Conduct visits to 2 local bar associations and interviews with attorneys/mukhtars/N GOs,etc		X			UTBA MoJ UNDP	UTBA	International Consultant (20 w/days- \$ 700 daily)	\$ 14,000	\$ 33,750
								Local Consultant (20 w/days- \$ 600 daily)	\$ 12,000	\$ 12,737.50
								Travel and Accommodation	\$ 14,250	4,472.49
								Translation and Interpretation	\$ 11,000	\$ 2,048.01
								Miscellaneous	\$ 13,500	6,036.30
	Develop a needs assessment/recommendations report focusing on locality-specific legal aid needs		X			UTBA MoJ UNDP	SIDA	International Consultant (50 w/days- \$ 700 daily)	\$ 35,000	\$ 0
								Local Consultant (54 w/days- \$ 600 daily)	\$ 32,400	\$ 19,327.63
								Travel and Accommodation	\$ 38,850	\$ 35,384.44
								Translation and Interpretation	\$ 16,900	

								Organizational Expenses of 8 one-day trainings (each having 25 participants) (Unit rate per participant is \$ 100)	\$ 20,000	
	Conduct technical trainings for 200 Attorneys in referred provinces			X						
	Organize 2 coordination meetings with civil society organizations by Advisory Committee			X				Organizational Expenses of 2 one day meetings (each having 40 participants) (Unit rate per participant is \$ 100)	\$ 8,000	
	Develop a strategy paper and road map for UTBA for improvement of legal aid services				X					
Result II- Enhanced Capacity of the Attorneys Practicing Legal Aid for Disadvantaged Groups	Conduct a study tour to a Continental Europe Country	X				UTBA MoJ UNDP	SIDA	International Consultant (80 w/days- \$ 700 daily)	\$ 56,000	\$ 0
								Local Consultant (45 w/days- \$ 600 daily)	\$ 27,000	\$ 0
								Travel and Accommodation	\$ 78,750	\$ 5,821.60
								Translation and	\$ 27,600	\$ 359.71

	Conduct a comparative assessment on legal aid practices	X						Interpretation		
	Conduct interviews with 5 selected bar associations and Union of Bar Associations		X					Miscellaneous	\$ 14,000	\$ 483.19
	Desk review of the data on cases subject to legal aid		X							
	Develop a report on the assessment of the legal aid practices targeting women, children and youth		X							
Project Manager (UNDP Cluster Leader)		X	X	X	X		SIDA		\$ 30,000	\$ 32,239.80
Project Associate		X	X	X	X		SIDA		\$ 24,000	
Project Support Staff Cost		X	X	X	X		SIDA		\$ 12,000	
M&E Specialist		X	X	X	X		SIDA		\$ 12,000	
UNV									\$ 0	\$ 10,444.63
General Management Services & Support Cost (%8)	Overheads: General Management Services				X		SIDA		\$ 43,672	\$ 23,568.97
General Management Services & Support Cost (%8)	Overheads: General Management Services				X		UTBA		\$ 6,780	

Explanations of other activity related expenditure (Annex V)	Activity 1							Translation Costs	\$ 0	\$ 701.47
								Sundry		\$ 55.38
	Activity 2							Organization		\$ 86,254.49
								Sundry		\$ 266.89
	Activity 6							Travel	\$ 0	\$ 2,127.76
								Organization		\$ 26,133.55
								Sundry		\$ 965.38
								Bank Charges		\$ 59.80
								Equipment/Supplies		\$ 2,780.97
Reimbursements									\$ 0	\$ - 12,542.51
Direct Project Cost (DPC) 3%									\$ 0	\$ 14,510.43
TOTAL									\$ 681,102	\$ 317,951.76

Year: 2017

EXPECTED RESULTS	PLANNED ACTIVITIES	TIMEFRAME				RESPONSIBLE PARTY	PLANNED BUDGET		Amount (USD)	
		Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4		Funding Source	Budget Description	Planned	Actual
Result II- Enhanced Capacity of the Attorneys Practicing Legal Aid for Disadvantaged Groups	Conduct a study tour to a Anglo-Saxon Country	X				UTBA MoJ UNDP	SIDA	International Consultants (223 w/days- \$ 700 daily)	\$ 156,100	\$ 58,478.82
								Local Consultants (101 w/days- \$ 600 daily)	\$ 60,600	\$ 43,182.49

	Develop tailor-made training modules for the CCP attorneys		X	X				Travel and Accommodation	\$ 303,300	\$ 5,186.34
	Organize a meeting with the participation of the Heads of Trainee Education Commissions			X				Translation and Interpretation	\$ 23,400	\$ 4,669.44
	Develop selection criteria for the attorneys who will attend the trainings			X				Organizational Expenses of 1 day meeting for 100 participants (Unit rate per participant is \$ 100)	\$ 10,000	\$ 216,964.55
	Deliver 10 one-day tailor-made training programs for CCP attorneys (300)				X			Organizational Expenses of 10 one-day trainings for 300 attorneys in total (30 participants for each training) + 6 Consultants + 1 UNDP + 2 UTBA + 2 Interpreters	\$ 41,000	

	Develop tailor-made Guidelines for the use of CCP attorneys on legal aid				X			Organizational Expenses of 2 days meeting on the development of guidelines (selected 7 Bar Association representatives from 7 Regions + UNDP + UTBA Representatives + consultants) (Unit rate per participant is \$ 100)	\$ 4,000	
								Printing and dissemination	\$ 40,000	
								Miscellaneous	\$ 5,000	\$ 62.77
Result V- Legal aid needs underpinned and services improved in the southern provinces of Turkey including Gaziantep, Hatay, Kilis and	Organize 2 coordination meetings with civil society organizations by Advisory Committee			X		UTBA MoJ UNDP	SIDA	Local Consultants (4 w/days- \$ 600 daily)	\$ 2,400	\$ 9,094.7
								Travel and Accommodation	\$12,600	\$ 2,398.28

Kahramanmaraş								Organizational Expenses of 2 one day meetings (each having 40 participants) (Unit rate per participant is \$ 100)	\$ 8,000	\$ 22,791.11
Project Manager (UNDP Cluster Leader)		X	X	X	X		<i>SIDA</i>		\$ 30,000	\$ 75,062.33
Project Associate		X	X	X	X				\$ 24,000	
Project Support Staff Cost		X	X	X	X		<i>SIDA</i>		\$ 12,000	
M&E Specialist		X	X	X	X				\$ 12,000	
UNV		X	X	X	X				\$ 0	\$ 7,418.15
Explanations of other activity related expenditure (Annex V)	Activity 1							Travel	\$ 0	\$ 4,673.22
								Translation		\$ 1,878.76
								Organization		\$ 22,522.13
								Local Consultant		\$ 11,100.54
								Sundry		\$ 6.39
	Activity 4							Travel	\$ 0	\$ 1,401.16
								Organization		\$ 59,192.49
	Activity 5							Sundry	\$ 0	\$ 36.59
								Translation		\$ 2,325.20
								Courier Charge		\$ 1.29
	Activity 6							Organization	\$ 0	\$ 2,813.67
								Audit Fees		\$ 1,400.00
								Translation		\$ 140.48

								Office Supplies		\$ 408.30
								Travel		\$ 151.46
								Services to projects		\$ 12,000
								Sundry		\$ 41.28
General Management Services & Support Cost (%8)	Overheads: General Management Services		X				SIDA		\$ 59,552	\$ 45,125.14
TOTAL									\$ 803,952	\$ 609,117.56

Year: 2018

EXPECTED RESULTS	PLANNED ACTIVITIES	TIMEFRAME				RESPONSIBLE PARTY	PLANNED BUDGET		Amount (USD)	
		Q 1	Q2	Q3	Q 4		Funding Source	Budget Description	Planned	Actual
Result III- Improved Performance System for Legal Aid Services	Develop a comparative analysis report on the monitoring and evaluation of the quality of legal aid services	X				UTBA MoJ UNDP	SIDA	International Consultants (39 w/days- \$ 700 daily)	\$ 27,300	\$ 0
	Organize 3 consultation meetings with Consultation Group in Ankara		X	X				Local Consultants (24 w/days- \$ 600 daily)	\$ 14,400	\$ 2,043.24
	Develop the first draft performance criteria			X				Travel and Accommodation	\$ 30,600	\$ 4,544.17
								Translation and Interpretation	\$ 10,400	\$ 521.80

	Organize 7 regional meetings with the representatives of Bar Associations to discuss the first draft			X				Organizational Expenses of 2 days 3 working meeting on the development of performance criteria and evaluation system (Selected 7 Bar Association representatives from 7 Regions + UNDP + UTBA Representatives + Consultants) (Unit rate per participant is \$ 100)	\$ 12,000	\$ 76,311.53
	Finalize the performance criteria of the attorneys performing legal aid and evaluation model.							Organizational Expenses of 1 day 7 regional meetings for 50 participants in total for each meeting (Unit rate per participant is \$ 100)	\$ 35,000	
Result IV-Enhanced Coordination and Cooperation among the Attorneys Practicing Legal Aid	Develop an interactive website where the attorneys practicing legal aid can follow the recent developments			X		UTBA UNDP	SIDA	Professional Services	\$ 15,000	\$ 0

								Translation & Interpretation	\$ 750	\$ 548.76
Result V- Legal aid needs underpinned and services improved in the southern provinces of Turkey including Gaziantep, Hatay, Kilis and Kahramanmaraş								Local Consultants (4 w/days- \$ 600 daily)	\$ 2,400	\$ 19,169.45
								Travel and Accommodation	\$ 12,600	\$ 111.48
								Organizational Expenses of 2 one day meetings (each having 40 participants) (Unit rate per participant is \$ 100)	\$ 8,000	\$ 18,043.39
Project Manager (UNDP Cluster Leader)		X	X				SIDA		\$ 15,000	\$ 60,781.19
Project Associate		X	X				SIDA		\$ 12,000	
Project Support Staff Cost		X	X				SIDA		\$ 6,000	
M&E Specialist		X	X				SIDA		\$ 6,000	
UNV									\$ 0	\$ 10,219.19
	Activity 1							Travel	\$ 0	\$ 1,144.57
								Organization		\$ 92,158.89
								Translation		\$ 110.40
								Sundry		\$ 3.34

Explanations of other activity related expenditure (Annex V)	Activity 2							Travel	\$ 0	\$ 2,919.23
								Organization		\$ 185,512.34
								Local Consultants		\$ 59,514.14
								Promotional Materials and Distr.		\$ 5,712.31
								Translation		\$ 6,830.16
								Sundry		\$ 132.43
								Svc Co-Public Admin, Politics		\$ 38,400.00
								Courier Charges		\$ 187.09
	Activity 4							Travel	\$ 0	\$ 482.04
								Organization		\$ 18,476.71
								Sundry		\$ 22.13
	Activity 5							Translation	\$ 0	\$ 938.64
								Courier Charges		\$ 10.23
	Activity 6							Travel	\$ 0	\$ 700.90
								Local Consultant		\$ 320.00
								Translation		\$ 944.10
								Audit Fees		\$ 1,570.00
								Services to Projects		\$ 13,400.00
								Office Costs		\$ 466.81
								Courier Charges		\$ 14.02
								Sundry		\$ 76.45
General Management Services & Support Cost (%8)	Overheads: General Management Services			X			SIDA		\$ 16,596	\$ 49,820.49
TOTAL									\$ 224,046	\$ 672,513.46

Year: 2019

EXPECTED RESULTS	PLANNED ACTIVITIES	TIMEFRAME				RESPONSIBLE PARTY	PLANNED BUDGET		Amount (USD)	
		Q 1	Q2	Q3	Q 4		Funding Source	Budget Description	Planned	Actual
<i>Explanations of other activity related expenditure</i> <i>(Annex V)</i>	Activity 1						SIDA	Local Consultant	\$ 0	\$ 25,217.39
	Activity 2						SIDA	Travel	\$ 0	\$ 6,390.15
								Organization		\$ 49,876.32
								Local Consultants		\$ 27,711.94
								Video Production		\$ 2,343.88
								Translation		\$ 575.98
								Services to projects		\$ 4,500.00
	Activity 3						SIDA	Travel	\$ 0	\$ 721.29
								Organization		\$ 7,669.55
								Local Consultant		\$ 16,678.39
	Activity 4						SIDA	Local Consultant	\$ 0	\$ 8,400.00
	Activity 6						SIDA	Int'l Consultants	\$ 0	\$ 7,650.01
								Translation		\$ 3,514.97
								Travel		\$ 506.58
								Services to Projects		\$ 15.98
								Courier Charges		\$ 3.42
								Sundry		\$ 94.77
	Service Contracts						SIDA		\$ 0	\$ 21,509.70
	UNV						SIDA		\$ 0	\$ 4,561.29
<i>General Management Services & Support Cost (%8)</i>							SIDA		\$ 0	\$ 15,035.33
TOTAL									\$ 0	\$ 202,977.42

Year	Planned Total	Realized Total	Difference	
2015	\$88,020.00	\$31,825.00	\$56,195.00	
2016	\$681,102.00	\$317,951.76	\$363,150.24	
2017	\$803,952.00	\$609,117.56	\$194,834.44	
2018	\$224,046.00	\$672,513.46	-\$448,467.46	
2019	\$0.00	\$202,977.42	-\$202,977.42	
Grand Total	\$1,797,120.00			
Revised Total due to Currency Fluctuation Between SEK and USD	\$1,874,875.61	\$1,834,385.20	\$40,509.09	
			Remaining SIDA Budget	Remaining UTBA Budget
			\$31,304.92	\$9,185.49

5. ANNEXES

Annex I: Regulation on Legal Aid Services to be Provided in Accordance with the Code of Criminal Procedure

Annex II: Support to the Improvement of Legal Aid Practices for Access to Justice for All in Turkey Strategy Paper and Roadmap

Annex III: Improved Performance System for Legal Aid Services

3.1. Regional Meeting Reports I

3.2. Regional Meeting Reports II

3.3. A comparative analysis report on the monitoring and evaluation of the quality of legal aid services

3.4. Consultation Meeting Reports

3.5. Performance criteria of the attorneys performing legal aid and evaluation model

Annex IV: Inception Phase Outcome I and II - Compiled Evaluation Report

Annex V: Financial Report Narrative

Report Submitted By:

Name/Surname: Orhun Yurtvermez

Title: Project Manager

Date: 4 October 2019

Signature: 